

SUBJECT INDEX

Administrative Appeals Chamber Reports 2011

CAPITAL

Capital held in joint savings account – proper approach in Scots Law to determining whether funds in the account belonged to claimant and his wife or whether that presumption was rebutted by other evidence

JK v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (JSA) [2010] UKUT 437 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 26](#)

Claimant with two bank accounts with same bank – whether overdraft to be deducted from credit balance in calculation of capital

JRL v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (JSA) [2011] UKUT 63 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 30](#)

Disregard of trust fund derived from compensation for personal injury – meaning of “in consequence of any personal injury” – compensation for negligence of solicitors in pursuing personal injury claim

KQ v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (IS) [2011] UKUT 102 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 43](#)

CARER'S ALLOWANCE

Meaning of “receiving full-time education” – relevance of hours actually spent – application of *Deane* to the test in the primary legislation

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v ZC (CA) [2011] UKUT 2 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 28](#)

CHILD SUPPORT

Calculation of income – deprivation of income – meaning of “with a view to” reducing amount of assessable income

AC v Child maintenance and Enforcement Commission (CSM) [2009] UKUT 152 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 25](#)

Maintenance assessment – housing costs – interest on mortgage to buy out ex-partner's share in home

SJ v Child Maintenance and Enforcement Commission (CSM) [2010] UKUT 355 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 18](#)

Variation of maintenance calculation – ability to control assets as a matter of Scots Law

CS v Child Maintenance and Enforcement Commission and MS (CSM) [2010] UKUT 182 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 2](#)

Variation where income from company or business under control of non-resident parent – whether “just and equitable” requirement allows for part only of relevant income to be taken into account – relevance of facts found in court proceedings – meaning of “control” – effect of failure to notify non-resident parent of application

RC v Child Maintenance and Enforcement Commission (CSM) [2009] UKUT 62 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 38](#)

CRIMINAL INJURIES COMPENSATION

Awards for mental injury – differences between 1996 scheme and 2001 scheme – meaning of “change in medical condition” in test for re-opening a case

R (SS) v First-tier Tribunal (CIC) [2010] UKUT 410 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 21](#)

Reduction and withholding of awards – conduct of applicant – when behaviour causing or contributing to the incident makes it inappropriate to award full compensation

R (SB) v First-tier Tribunal (CIC) [2010] UKUT 250 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 11](#)

Reduction and withholding of awards – meaning of “failed to co-operate with the police ... in attempting to bring the assailant to justice”

R (CR) v First-tier Tribunal (CIC) [2010] UKUT 388 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 19](#)

See also: Practice and procedure

EUROPEAN UNION LAW

Discrimination on ground of sex – male-to-female transgender person remaining married to wife and claiming Category A retirement pension before Gender Recognition Act 2004 came into force – whether criteria of Act apply

Timbrell v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions [2010] EWCA Civ 701 [\[2011\] AACR 13](#)

Free movement of workers – right of permanent residence pursuant to Article 16(1) of Directive 2004/38/EC – whether period of five years completed before 30 April 2006 to be taken into account – effect of absence of less than two years after completion of that period

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v Lassal Case C-162/09 [\[2011\] AACR 33](#)

Right to reside – whether condition contrary to Article 3 Regulation (EEC) 1408/71

Patmalnice v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions [2011] UKSC 11 [\[2011\] AACR 34](#)

HOUSING AND COUNCIL TAX BENEFIT

Housing benefit – maximum rent and occupation of the home – meaning of “occupier” for local housing allowance purposes – shared care of child – whether foster-child occupier of home

Wirral MBC v AH and Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (HB) [2010] UKUT 208 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 6](#)

See also: Practice and procedure

HUMAN RIGHTS

Article 6 of the European Convention on Human Rights – whether hearing in mental health case should be held in public at request of applicant

AH v West London Mental Health Trust and another [2010] UKUT 264 (AAC) and [2011] UKUT 74 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 15](#)

Burden of proof – whether tribunal’s approach to discretion in breach of Article 5 or Article 8 of the Convention

RH v South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust and Secretary of State for Justice [2010] EWCA Civ 1273 [\[2011\] AACR 14](#)

Funeral payment – whether statutory scheme discriminatory contrary to Article 14 of the Convention in case of Jewish funeral

RM v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (IS) [2010] UKUT 220 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 8](#)

See also: Practice and procedure

INCAPACITY FOR WORK

Exceptional circumstances – allergy – correct approach to test of substantial risk to mental or physical health if found capable of work

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v Cattrell [2011] EWCA Civ 572

[\[2011\] AACR 35](#)

INCOME

Computation of earnings – salaried employee becoming part-time – whether payment in respect of month of transition to be treated as two separate payments

KJ v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (CA) [2010] UKUT 218 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 7](#)

Payments to residential college for accommodation costs – whether to be treated as notional income or disregarded because college was a “care home”

SA v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (IS) [2011] UKUT 345 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 16](#)

See also: Child support

INCOME SUPPORT AND STATE PENSION CREDIT

State pension credit – minimum guarantee – meaning of “members of a religious order fully maintained by their order”

Scott v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions [2011] EWCA Civ 103

[\[2011\] AACR 23](#)

INDUSTRIAL DISEASE

Prescribed disease A4 – task-specific focal dystonia – meaning of “task-specific” – whether includes cervical dystonia

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v CS (II) [2010] UKUT 198 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 4](#)

INFORMATION RIGHTS

Environmental information – local property searches and enquiries

Kirklees Council v Information Commissioner and another [2011] UKUT 104 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 44](#)

JOBSEEKER’S ALLOWANCE

Housing costs – long tenancy – rent payable under Ijarah method of financing house purchase – whether qualifies for housing costs

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v UP (JSA) [2010] UKUT 262 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 12](#)

Remunerative work – seasonal self-employment – calculation of earnings

GM v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (JSA) [2010] UKUT 221 (AAC)

[\[2011\] AACR 9](#)

JUDICIAL REVIEW

Scope of judicial review of refusal of permission to appeal by Upper Tribunal in Scotland – whether standard to be applied the same as in England and Wales

Eba v the Advocate General for Scotland [2011] UKSC 29 [2011] AACR 39

Scope of judicial review of refusal of permission to appeal by Upper Tribunal in England and Wales – standard to be applied

R (Cart) v the Upper Tribunal, R (MR (Pakistan) (FC)) v the Upper Tribunal) and another [2011] UKSC 28 [2011] AACR 38

JURISDICTION

First-tier Tribunal– disability discrimination – meaning of “admissions” decision

AS v Buckinghamshire County Council (SEN)[2010] UKUT 407 (AAC) [2011] AACR 20

Scope of right of appeal to Upper Tribunal against interlocutory decisions – meaning of “decision” in Tribunals, Courts and Enforcement Act 2007

LS v London Borough of Lambeth (HB) [2010] UKUT 461 (AAC) [2011] AACR 27

Tribunal jurisdiction in mental health cases – whether application lapses when community treatment order made

AA v Cheshire and Wirral Partnership NHS Foundation Trust and others [2009] UKUT 195 (AAC) [2011] AACR 37

Tribunal jurisdiction in mental health cases – whether application on revocation of community treatment order lapses when new community treatment order made

PS v Camden and Islington NHS Foundation Trust [2011] UKUT 143 (AAC) [2011] AACR 42

MENTAL HEALTH

Restriction order – patient convicted of manslaughter relatively unlikely to reoffend – whether adequate reasons given for maintaining restriction order

RH v South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust and Secretary of State for Justice [2010] EWCA Civ 1273 [2011] AACR 14

See also: Human rights

Practice and procedure

PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE

Case management of successive applications to First-tier Tribunal by patients subject to sections 2 and 3 of the Mental Health Act 1983 – effect of community treatment order on reference to First-tier Tribunal

KF and others v Birmingham and Solihull Mental Health Foundation Trust and another [2010] UKUT 185 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 3](#)

Criteria for suspension of effect of tribunal decision

Carmarthenshire County Council v M and JW (SEN) [2010] UKUT 348 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 17](#)

Direction barring teacher from work with children – nature of appeal – admissible evidence

Secretary of State for Education v JN [2010] UKUT 248 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 10](#)

Extension of time for appeal against cancellation of registration as childcare provider – review of decision to extend time for appeal

OFSTED v AF [2011] UKUT 72 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 32](#)

Extension of time for appeal – whether tribunal should have regard to CPR rule 3.9

R (CD) v First-tier Tribunal (CIC) [2010] UKUT 181 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 1](#)

Fair hearing – whether hearing in mental health case should be held in public at request of applicant

AH v West London Mental Health Trust and another [2010] UKUT 264 (AAC) [2011] and UKUT 74 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 15](#)

Fair hearing – medical examination by tribunal members – duty to put any new findings from examination to the claimant for comment

MB v Department for Social Development (II) [2010] NCom 133 [\[2011\] AACR 41](#)

Fair hearing – role of representative appointed by tribunal – review by tribunal judge of his/her own decision

AA v Cheshire and Wirral Partnership NHS Foundation Trust and others [2009] UKUT 195 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 37](#)

Inadequate notice of housing benefit decision – effect on time limits for appeal

LS v London Borough of Lambeth (HB) [2010] UKUT 461 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 27](#)

Majority decision – decision notice and statement of reasons – whether tribunal obliged to record that decision not unanimous

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v SS (DLA) [2010] UKUT 384 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 24](#)

Permission to appeal to Court of Appeal – grounds of appeal different from those argued before Upper Tribunal

Secretary of State for Work and Pensions v Cattrell [2011] EWCA Civ 572 [\[2011\] AACR 35](#)

Permission to appeal to Court of Appeal – new issue raised after decision of Upper Tribunal

RH v South London and Maudsley NHS Foundation Trust and Secretary of State for Justice [2010] EWCA Civ 1273 [\[2011\] AACR 14](#)

Upper Tribunal – enforcement reference

MD v Secretary of State for Work and Pensions (Enforcement reference) [2010] UKUT 202 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 5](#)

Upper Tribunal – enforcement reference – penalties

CB v Suffolk County Council (Enforcement reference) [2010] UKUT 413 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 22](#)

Whether tribunal may treat letter as application

PS v Camden and Islington NHS Foundation Trust [2011] UKUT 143 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 42](#)

RECOVERY OF OVERPAYMENT

Entitlement decision properly made but not communicated to the claimant – whether recoverability decision based on that decision ineffective

Hamilton v Department for Social Development [2010] NICA 46 [2011] AACR 40

RESIDENCE AND PRESENCE CONDITIONS

See: European Union law

SCOTS LAW

*See: Child support
Judicial review*

SPECIAL EDUCATIONAL NEEDS

Special educational provision – education otherwise than in a school – parents wishing education partly at school and partly at home – meaning of “education in a school”

MS v London Borough of Brent (SEN) [2011] UKUT 50 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 29](#)

Special educational provision – naming of school – unreasonable public expenditure – calculation of cost at maintained school

EH v Kent County Council (SEN) [2011] EWCA Civ 709) [\[2011\] AACR 36](#)

Special educational provision – naming of school – unreasonable public expenditure – whether reasonableness limited to educational benefits

K v London Borough of Hillingdon (SEN) [2011] UKUT 71 (AAC) [\[2011\] AACR 31](#)

See also: Practice and procedure